



フランチェスコ・ボッティチーニ [フィレンツェ 1446-1498]

《聖ニコラウスと聖カタリナ、聖ルチア、  
聖マルゲリータ、聖アポローニア》

テンペラ、板（ベニヤに移し換え）  
115 × 122.5 cm

Francesco Botticini [Firenze 1446-1498]

*Saint Nicolas and Saints Catherine, Lucy,  
Margaret and Apollonia*

Tempera on panel  
115 × 122.5 cm  
P.2005-3

来歴 Provenance: Charles Butler, London; His sale, London, Christie's, 25 May 1911, lot.77, bought by Wallis as by Cosimo Rosselli; With A. H. Buttery, London, 1917; William H. Woodward, London, by 1931; His sale, New York, Sotheby's Parke Bernet, 15 November 1945, lot.28; Weisl Collection, New York; Anonymous sale, London, Sotheby's, 8 April 1987, lot.3 as "attributed to Francesco Botticini"; Sotheby's London, 3 July 1991, lot.9; Private Collection, Japan.

文献 Literature: B. Berenson, *Florentine Painters of the Renaissance*, 1909, p.120 as by Francesco Botticini; R. van Marle, *The Development of the Italian Schools of Painting*, vol.XI, 1929, p.614; vol.XIII, 1931, p.418; vol.XVI, 1937, p.203 as by Cosimo Rosselli; B. Berenson, *Quadri senza casa- Il Quattrocento fiorentino III*, "Dedalo", vol.XII, 1932,

pp.821, 824 (illust.) as by Master of San Miniato; B. Berenson, *Italian Pictures of the Renaissance: Florentine School*, vol.I, London, 1963, p.146, fig.1053, as by Master of San Miniato; L. Bellosi, *Intorno ad Andrea del Castagno*, "Paragone", Anno XVIII, n.211/31-settembre, 1967, pp.14-15, as by Francesco Botticini; M. Boskovits, *Una scheda e qualche suggerimento per un catalogo dei dipinti ai Tatti*, "Antichità Viva", anno XIV n.2, 1975, pp.17-19, fig.16, as by Francesco Botticini; A. Padoa Rizzo, *Per Francesco Botticini*, "Antichità Viva", Anno XV n.5, 1976, pp.3-19, fig.6, as by Francesco Botticini; G. Dalli Regoli, *Il "Maestro di San Miniato". Lo stato degli studi, i problemi, le risposte della filologia*, Pisa 1988, pp.22, 110, nota 5, 118; L. Venturini, *Francesco Botticini*, Firenze, 1994, pp.26-27, 99, no.1, fig.1, as by Francesco Botticini.

本作品の作者フランチェスコ・ボッティチーニは、1970年代後半になってようやくそのアイデンティティおよびコルプスが整理された画家で、現在も研究途上にある。20世紀初めの研究では、1470年代のフィレンツェ絵画の様式そのものが混乱した状況を見せていた。そのため本作品の作者帰属に関してもこれまでさまざまな意見が出されていた。たとえばベレンソンは、一度本作品をフランチェスコ・ボッティチーニに帰属したが(1090年)、のちにこの作家と密接な様式関係をもつ通称「サン・ミニアートの画家」へと説を覆した(1932年)。<sup>註1)</sup>一方ファン・マールは一貫してコジモ・ロッセッリへの帰属を主張していた。<sup>註2)</sup>しかし、本作品を含めて、「サン・ミニアートの画家」

やフェデリコ・ゼーリが想定した「ベレンソン＝コロナ家のプレデッラの画家」、あるいはジャック・マルタンドレ美術館にある1471年の年記のある祭壇画の作者など、さまざまな作者に帰属されていた作品群をエヴェレット・フェイナルチャーノ・ベッローシが同一作者の作品としてグループ化し、この説を踏まえてパドア＝リッツォが、こうした一群の作品の作者をフランチェスコ・ボッティチーニとして、本作品を含む現存する数少ないボッティチーニの作品群をまとめた。<sup>註3)</sup> またヴェントゥリーニがまとめた現在ボッティチーニに関する唯一のモノグラフにおいても、本作品はボッティチーニの手によるきわめて重要な初期作品として位置づけられている。<sup>註4)</sup>

本作品は、残念ながら当初の支持体である板は失われ、ベニヤに移し換えられている。にもかかわらず、状態は非常に良く、人物の頭部や衣装はほぼ完全な状態を保っている。縦に5カ所の古い板の継ぎ目や裂け目の修復痕、および下辺に補彩が確認されるが、その他には甚大な損傷は確認されない。この当時の板絵としては比較的良好な状態であると言える。したがって、支持体の板そのものの損傷にもかかわらず大切に保管されてきたことが想像される。修復が行なわれたのは、想像の域を出ないが、ベレンソンが保管していた古い写真を比較検討した結果（ヴィツラ・イ・タッティ研究所、フィレンツェ）、ヴァイスル・コレクションからオークションに出された時期にはすでに修復が行なわれたことが窺われる。

フランチェスコ・ボッティチーニは1446年フィレンツェに生まれ、13歳の時ネーリ・ディ・ピッチの工房に入り修業した後（1459年）、1460年代半ば頃から画家として本格的な仕事を始めた。彼が制作した基準作となる作品のうち、署名もしくは年記のあるものは2点しかない。現在ジャック・マルタンドレ美術館にある1471年の年記のある《玉座の聖母子と4聖人》とエンボリのピエーヴェ聖堂主祭壇画（現在エンボリ、コレジヤータ美術館）である。後者の作品については、1484年にエンボリの聖堂参事会から注文を請け負いながら、未完のまま残され、彼は1498年に没した。このエンボリの祭壇画は1504年に彼の息子ラファエッロ・ボッティチーニが完成させた。そもそもフランチェスコ・ボッティチーニの作品群に混乱を生じさせた原因はヴァザーリが『芸術家列伝』『ボッティチエリ』中の作品記述において、ボッティチエリの作品とボッティチーニの作品を混同していることに遡る。しかし、ヴァザーリの記述はむしろ、ボッティチエリもボッティチーニもほぼ同じ絵画環境で絵を学び、同時期に活躍したことにより、かなり古い時期から両者の様式が混同されていたことを如実に物語っている。<sup>註5)</sup>

フランチェスコの画業は、まさに1460年代から80年代までのフィレンツェの美術史的動向を如実に反映したものとなっている。初期作品として位置づけられる1471年以前の作品群には、明らかにアントニオ・ボッライウオーロ（特に1467年のサン・ミニアート・アル・モンテ聖堂ポルトガル枢機卿の礼拝堂祭壇画）やヴェロッキオの影響が顕著である。しかし1471年のジャック・マルタンドレの祭壇画では、1470年にボッティチエリやヴェロッキオらに注文された商業裁判所の「美德」連作に見られるような装飾的構図や造形言語を見せ始める。一方、彼の重要な作品として長いこと議論されてきたウフィツィ美術館の《トビアスと三天使》は、パドア＝リッツォによれば1470-73年頃、ジャック・マルタンドレの祭壇画の直後に置かれている。<sup>註6)</sup>

一方本作品とフィレンツェのサント・スピリト聖堂にある《聖モニカと修道女たち》とのあいだに見られる様式的な近似性は、すでにベッローシが指摘しており、そこに見られる過度な装飾を抑えた背景の堅固な建築構造とシンメトリーを強く意識した均斉のとれた人物配置などから、ボッライウオーロのポルトガル枢機卿礼拝堂祭壇画が制作された1467年から71年のジャック・マルタンドレの祭壇画のあいだ、すなわち、下限が1471年と結論づけられている。<sup>註7)</sup> また、本作品ときわめて様式的な類似を見せる《ベレンソン＝コロナ家のプレデッラ》もこの時期に位置づけられた。

本作品が当初置かれた場所については、ヴェントゥリーニも述べているとおり、現在のところ全く情報はない。<sup>註8)</sup> すでに述べたように16世紀の段階ですでにボッティチーニの様式はボッティチエリの様式と混同されていたこともあり、16世紀以降の美術品の記述を含む古文獻にはボッティチーニの名前はほとんど見当たらない。また、管見の限り、ジュゼッペ・リーカをはじめとしたフィレンツェの古い案内書等を詳細に分析してもなお、残念ながら本作品に該当する作品の記述は見出されない。<sup>註9)</sup> また本作品が1785年にトスカナ大公ピエトロ・レオポルドが発した同信会の解散命令に伴う財産目録や1808年のナポレオンによる教会組織の解体に伴う美術品流出と関連づけられるとすれば、それ以前にはいずれかの宗教施設にあったことが予測され、同時に本来の作者名が失われて別の作者の作品として認識されていた可能性がある。しかし、フィレンツェ国立文書館に保管されている該当文書を網羅的に調査したにもかかわらず、残念ながら本作品の出所を確認するには至らなかった。また、フィレンツェ特殊美術館監督局付属カタログ文書室に保管されている19世紀はじめのナポレオン政府時代から20世紀初めにかけてのフィレンツェ美術監督局所管の美術品輸出認可記録も確認したが、該当する記録は見つからなかったことを報告せざるを得ない。ボッティチーニはフィレンツェの郊外あるいはアルノ川下流域もしくはエルサ川流域の地方都市でも活動していることから、今後は、困難が伴うとはいえ、これらの地域の古文獻をたどる必要がある。

本作品は、決して大巨匠とは言えない作家の作品ではあるものの、1460年代から70年代にかけてのフィレンツェ美術の流れを端的に示している。そこにはドメニコ・ヴェネツィアーノの《聖ルチア祭壇画》の影響から、<sup>註10)</sup> アンドレア・デル・カスターニョ、ボッライウオーロ、ヴェロッキオ、そしてボッティチエリらの影響までもが示されている、美術史研究上、貴重な作品であると言える。（高梨光正）

#### 註

- 1) Bernard Berenson, *Florentine Painters of the Renaissance*, 1909, p.120; Bernard Berenson, *Quadri senza casa- Il Quattrocento fiorentino III*, "Dedalo", vol.XII, 1932, pp.821, 824 (illustr.); B. Berenson, *Italian Pictures of the Renaissance: Florentine School*, vol.I, London, 1963, p.146, fig.1053. cfr. *Il 'Maestro di San Miniato': lo stato degli studi, I problemi, le risposte della filologia*, a cura di Gigetta Dalli Regoli, Pisa, 1988, pp.22, 110, n.5.
- 2) Raimond van Marle, *The Development of the Italian Schools of Painting*, vol.XI, 1929, p.614; vol.XIII, 1931, p.418; vol.XVI, 1937, p.203.
- 3) Federico Zeri, *Due dipinti, la filologia e un nome: il Maestro delle Tavole Barberini*, Milano 1961; Everette Fahy, *Some Early Italian Pictures in the Gambier-Pary Collection*, "The Burlington Magazine", vol.CIX 768, 1967, pp.128-139; Luciano Bellosi, *Intorno ad Andrea del Castagno*, "Paragone", Anno XVIII, n.211/31-settembre, 1967, pp.14-15; Anna Padua Rizzo, *Per Francesco Botticini*, "Antichità Viva", Anno XV n.5, 1976, pp.3-19; id, voce "Botticini, Francesco", in *Dizionario biografico degli italiani*, vol.XIII, 1971, pp.453-455.
- 4) Lisa Venturini, *Francesco Botticini*, Firenze, 1994, pp.26-27, 99, no.1.
- 5) Giorgio Vasari, *Le vite...*, a cura di Gaetano Milanesi, Firenze, 1906, III,

pp.322-323.

- 6) Anna Padoa Rizzo, *Per Francesco Botticini*, "Antichità Viva", Anno XV n.5, 1976, pp.8; id, "Botticini, Francesco", *cit.*, p.454.
- 7) Luciano Bellosi, *op. cit.*, pp.14-15; Padoa Rizzo, *op. cit.*, 1976, pp.5-6.
- 8) L. Venturini, *op. cit.*, p.27.
- 9) 筆者が参照したフィレンツェおよび周辺の歴史的ガイドは以下の通り。Ferdinando Leopoldo Del Migliore, *Firenze città nobilissima illustrata*, Firenze, 1684; Giuseppe Richa, *Notizie istoriche delle chiese fiorentine*, voll.X, Firenze, 1754-62; Vincenzo Follini & Modesto Rastrelli, *Firenze antica e moderna illustrata*, Firenze, 1789-1802; Francesco Fontani, *Viaggio pittorico della Toscana*, voll.VI, Firenze, 1827; Walter & Elisabeth Paatz, *Die Kirchen von Florenz*, in voll.VI, Frankfurt am Main, 1952-55.
- 10) Miklòs Boskovits, *Una scheda e qualche suggerimento per un catalogo dei dipinti ai Tatti*, "Antichità Viva", anno XIV n.2, 1975, pp.17-19, fig.16.

The identity and corpus of the painter of this work, Francesco Botticini, was finally recognized in the late 1970s, and research on the artist continues to increase. Early 20th century research revealed how researchers were confused about the situation in stylistic forms of Florentine painting during the 1470s. Such conditions led to various attributions being given to this painting over the course of its history. For example, Berenson briefly attributed this work to Botticini (1909), but then later (1932) attributed it to the Maestro di San Miniato, an artist whose style was closely related to that of Botticini.<sup>1)</sup> On the other hand, Van Marle has consistently asserted that the work is by Cosimo Rosselli.<sup>2)</sup> According to other theories, such as those of Everette Fahy and Luciano Bellosi, this work, along with a range of works that have been attributed to other artists, should be grouped and all be attributed to a single artist. The other artists in that group include *Maestro di San Miniato*, Frederico Zeri's conjured *Maestro della predella di Berenson-Colonna*, and the artist of the altarpiece dated to 1471 in the Musée Jacquemart-André. Based on this theory of the grouping of diverse works and attributing them to a single hand, Padoa Rizzo named Francesco Botticini as the painter of the group, and considered this painting one of the few extant works by Botticini.<sup>3)</sup> The only full monograph on Botticini, by Venturini, positions this work as one of the extremely important works of his early period.<sup>4)</sup>

Unfortunately, the original panel support for this work has been lost and it was transferred to a veneer panel. Nevertheless, the condition of the work is fairly good and the faces of the figures and the garment areas are almost completely intact. Vertically, there are five areas where traces of repair mark the seams and cracks that existed in the earlier panel support, and there are also sections of repainting in the lower edge. With these few exceptions, no major damage can be discerned, and the work is in relatively good condition for a panel painting of its period. Thus, with the exception of the original panel, this work appears to have been carefully maintained over its lifetime. It can only be conjecture, but based on comparisons between the painting's current state and its image seen in an old photograph taken when the work was under the care of Berenson (Harvard University Center for Italian Renaissance Studies, Villa i Tatti), it seems likely that the restoration was carried out before it was put up for auction when it left the Weisl Collection.

Francesco Botticini was born in Florence in 1446, and at the age of 13 in 1459, he entered the studio of Neri di Bicci. He began full work as a painter around the latter half of the 1460s. Of the works considered to be his standard examples, only two are signed and dated. These works are the *Madonna in trono col Bambino e i quattro santi* (dated 1471, Musée Jacquemart-André), and *Tabernacle of the Sacrament* in Collegiata di S. Andrea in Empoli, today in the Museo della Collegiata di S. Andrea. The latter work was based on a commission received from the compagnia di Sant'Andrea of Empoli in 1484, and was left unfinished at Botticini's death in 1498. In 1504, Botticini's son Rafaello Botticini finished the Empoli tabernacle. One of the reasons behind the

confusion regarding Francesco Botticini's oeuvre lies in the fact that in his *Lives of the Artists*, Vasari mixed up the works of Botticini with those of Botticelli in his discussion of Botticelli. However, according to Vasari, Botticelli and Botticini studied painting in essentially the same artistic environment and were active in essentially the same period, and thus it is understandable that their styles could be confused from a relatively early point in history.<sup>5)</sup>

Francesco Botticini's oeuvre ably reflects the art historical movements of Florence from the 1460s through the 1480s. The early works dated prior to 1471 clearly reveal the marked influence of Antonio del Pollaiuolo (particularly his altarpiece for the Cappella del cardinale di Portogallo, chiesa di San Miniato al Monte dated to 1467), and the work of Verrocchio. However, the 1471 altarpiece today in the Musée Jacquemart-André marks the beginning of decorative compositions and figurative vocabulary seen in a series of "virtues" works commissioned by the *Arte della Mercatanzia* in Florence from Botticelli, Verrocchio and others. On the other hand, the important and long debated work, *Tre Archangeli con Tobia* in the Uffizi Gallery, was, according to Padoa Rizzo, painted in ca. 1470-73, immediately after the 1471 altarpiece.<sup>6)</sup> On the other hand, Bellosi has already indicated the stylistic resemblance between this work and the *Santa Monica da la regola alle monache agostiniane* in the Chiesa di Santo Spirito. Here the background reveals a firm architectural structure in which the overly decorative quality seen in *Santa Monica* has been subdued, and in which the figures have been arranged in an intentionally symmetrical and balanced order. These factors all indicate that the work should be dated no later than 1471, and most likely somewhere between Pollaiuolo's 1467 altarpiece and the Jacquemart altarpiece dated to 1471.<sup>7)</sup> Further, the Berenson-Colonna predella, which is extremely close to this work stylistically, should also be placed in that time frame.

According to Venturini's comments, there is absolutely no information regarding the original disposition of this work.<sup>8)</sup> As has been noted above, in the 16th century there was confusion regarding the styles of Botticelli and Botticini, and there are almost no documents, including notes regarding art works dated after the end of the 16th century, which include Botticini's name. Further, as far as could be determined by the author through a careful analysis of old guides to Florence, including that of Guiseppe Richa, those guides unfortunately do not include mention of this work.<sup>9)</sup> This painting was listed in the 1785 inventory that accompanied the disbanding of the company formed by Pietro Leopoldo, Grand duke of Tuscany, and is related to the dispersal of art works held by church organizations by Napoleon in 1808. Presumably, prior to that time the work was in some church facility. It also could be the case that during that period the original authorship was forgotten, and the work may have been recognized at that time as being by a different hand. However, in spite of a comprehensive search of the relevant documents in the Archivio di Stato di Firenze, there is no evidence of the original disposition of this work. Further, a study of the *Richiesta di esportazione nelle Archivio storico della Galleria degli Uffizi*, the register of permissions to export works that were under the control of the Florentine art bureaucracy dating from the early 19th century Napoleonic rule to the beginning of the 20th century, reveals no record of a work that corresponds to this painting. As Botticini was also active in the Val d'Arno and Val d'Elsa regions outside of Florence, while difficult, a further search of documents in these areas is essential.

This work, a painting by an artist that can by no means be considered a great master, reveals a glimpse of the art movements in Florence during the 1460s to 1470s. In terms of art history, this work can be considered important given the influence it reveals from the Pala di Santa Lucia de' Medagnoli by Domenico Veneziano<sup>10)</sup> and other influence by artists such as Andrea del Castagno, Pollaiuolo, Verrocchio and Botticelli.

(Mitsumasa Takanashi)

## Notes

- 1) Bernard Berenson, *Florentine Painters of the Renaissance*, 1909, p.120; Bernard Berenson, *Quadri senza casa- Il Quattrocento fiorentino III*, "Dedalo", vol.XII, 1932, pp.821, 824 (illust.); B. Berenson, *Italian Pictures of the Renaissance: Florentine School*, vol.1, London, 1963, p.146, fig.1053. cfr. *Il 'Maestro di San Miniato': lo stato degli studi, I problemi, le risposte della filologia*, a cura di Gigetta Dalli Regoli, Pisa, 1988, pp.22, 110, n.5.
- 2) Raimond van Marle, *The Development of the Italian Schools of Painting*, vol.XI, 1929, p.614; vol.XIII, 1931, p.418; vol.XVI, 1937, p.203.
- 3) Federico Zeri, *Due dipinti, la filologia e un nome: il Maestro delle Tavole Barberini*, Milano 1961; Everette Fahy, *Some Early Italian Pictures in the Gambier-Pary Collection*, "The Burlington Magazine", vol.CIX 768, 1967, pp.128-139; Luciano Bellosi, *Intorno ad Andrea del Castagno*, "Paragone", Anno XVIII, n.211/31-settembre, 1967, pp.14-15; Anna Padoa Rizzo, *Per Francesco Botticini*, "Antichità Viva", Anno XV n.5, 1976, pp.3-19; id, voce "Botticini, Francesco", in *Dizionario biografico degli italiani*, vol.XIII, 1971, pp.453-455.
- 4) Lisa Venturini, *Francesco Botticini*, Firenze, 1994, pp.26-27, 99, no.1.
- 5) Giorgio Vasari, *Le vite...*, a cura di Gaetano Milanesi, Firenze, 1906, III, pp.322-323.
- 6) Anna Padoa Rizzo, *Per Francesco Botticini*, "Antichità Viva", Anno XV n.5, 1976, pp.8; id, "Botticini, Francesco", *cit.*, p.454.
- 7) Luciano Bellosi, *op.cit.*, pp.14-15; Padoa Rizzo, *op.cit.*, 1976, pp.5-6.
- 8) L. Venturini, *op.cit.*, p.27
- 9) The author consulted the following historical guides to Florence and its surrounds. Ferdinando Leopoldo Del Migliore, *Firenze città nobilissima illustrata*, Firenze, 1684; Giuseppe Richa, *Notizie istoriche delle chiese fiorentine*, voll.X, Firenze, 1754-62; Vincenzo Follini & Modesto Rastrelli, *Firenze antica e moderna illustrata*, Firenze, 1789-1802; Francesco Fontani, *Viaggio pittorico della Toscana*, voll.VI, Firenze, 1827; Walter & Elisabeth Paatz, *Die Kirchen von Florenz*, in voll.VI, Frankfurt am Main, 1952-55.
- 10) Miklòs Boskovits, *Una scheda e qualche suggerimento per un catalogo dei dipinti ai Tatti*, "Antichità Viva", anno XIV n.2, 1975, pp.17-19, fig.16.